



Navigating Remedial Dhikr and Surah Memorization: A Quest for Improvement or Procedural Challenges?

Surawardi^{a)}, Saibatul Hamdi^{b)}, Ahmad Riyadh Maulidi^{c)}

a) UIN Antasari Banjarmasin, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0622-3876>

b) MA Sabial Muhtadin, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1663-1064>

c) MAN Kotawaringin Timur Plus Keterampilan, <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6049-4610>

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini mengeksplorasi fenomena pelaksanaan remedial yang berbeda dari praktik remedial umumnya. Dalam konteks ini, remedial melibatkan tugas membaca dhikr (zikir) dan menghafal surah-surah pendek selama proses pembelajaran. Penelitian bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan implementasi remedial ini serta latar belakang pelaksanaannya di MA Sabial Muhtadin. Pendekatan penelitian yang digunakan adalah kualitatif dengan metode fenomenologi. Subjek penelitian terdiri dari dua orang guru dan lima informan terkait. Hasil penelitian mengungkapkan sejumlah temuan. Pertama, pelaksanaan remedial melibatkan dua orang guru, namun proses ini tidak mencerminkan instrumen yang tepat untuk meningkatkan kualitas pembelajaran peserta didik. Peserta didik hanya diberikan tugas tambahan berupa menghafal tanpa mendapatkan bimbingan terkait indikator pembelajaran yang sebelumnya belum terselesaikan. Kedua, pelaksanaan remedial ini muncul karena guru menganggap alokasi waktu terbatas, sehingga mereka mengambil inisiatif untuk melaksanakan remedial yang dapat selesai dalam waktu singkat. Guru juga percaya bahwa remedial dapat mengkompensasi nilai siswa yang kurang memadai. Temuan ini menunjukkan bahwa pengetahuan guru tentang prosedur remedial yang benar masih minim. Ketiga, pelaksanaan remedial tidak selaras dengan prosedur remedial yang seharusnya, sehingga remedial ini tidak memberikan dampak signifikan terhadap perbaikan pemahaman peserta didik, malah menambah beban belajar mereka. Implikasi dari penelitian ini adalah memberikan rekomendasi bagi madrasah terkait untuk memperbaiki program remedial yang mereka laksanakan. Rekomendasi tersebut mencakup langkah-langkah aplikatif, seperti penyelenggaraan pelatihan bagi guru madrasah guna meningkatkan pemahaman mereka mengenai prosedur remedial yang benar.

ABSTRACT

This study explores a new phenomenon in the implementation of remedial practices that differ from the common remedial approaches. In this context, remedial activities involve reciting dhikr (remembrance of God) and memorizing short surahs (chapters) during the learning process. The research aims to describe the implementation of this remedial approach and the underlying reasons for its adoption at MA Sabial Muhtadin. The research employs a qualitative approach using phenomenological methods. The study subjects include two teachers and five relevant informants. The research findings reveal several key points. First, the remedial activities involve two teachers but do not appear to represent the appropriate instruments for enhancing the quality of students' learning. Students are only given additional tasks, such as memorization, without receiving guidance related to unfinished learning indicators. Second, the implementation of these remedial activities arises from teachers' perceptions of limited time allocation, prompting them to take the initiative to carry out remedial practices that can be completed quickly. Teachers also believe that remedial activities can compensate for students' inadequate grades. These findings indicate that teachers possess limited knowledge about the correct procedures for remedial practices. Third, the execution of remedial activities does not align with the proper remedial procedures, resulting in minimal impact on students' improved understanding and, in some cases, an additional learning burden. The implications of this research include providing recommendations to the relevant madrasah to improve their remedial programs. These recommendations encompass practical steps, such as organizing training sessions for madrasah teachers to enhance their understanding of the correct remedial procedures.

KATA KUNCI

Praktik Remedial ;
Hafalan Zikir dan Surat.

KEYWORDS

Remedial Practices ;
Dhikr and Surah
Memorization.

A. Introduction

Every lesson carried out requires evaluation activities. The evaluation process is carried out in order to see to what extent students achieve the expected goals in these learning activities. The level of achievement is measured using the Minimum Completion Criteria (KKM) which are determined for each subject by looking at various factors. Furthermore, the comparison between learning outcomes and minimum completeness criteria is used as a reference in determining whether a lesson is successful or not.¹

The teacher will observe the minimum completeness criteria after acquiring the learning outcomes of all students, which encompass both knowledge and skills. However, the minimum completeness criteria should not be overlooked during the planning phase of the learning process. It is imperative for the teacher to establish the minimum completeness criteria as a goal to be attained in order to design an optimal learning experience. If the majority of students fail to surpass the predetermined minimum completeness criteria, then the learning process is considered unsuccessful. This failure can stem from either the students themselves or the teaching methods, media, and other related factors employed by the teachers.² Hence, the instructor possesses the capability to determine the outcome or lack thereof of the educational procedure by evaluating the students' grades and subsequently categorizing them as finished or unfinished based on the specified minimal completion criteria.

As a consequence of the outcomes of the learning assessment that has been conducted, the subsequent duty of the teacher is to implement ameliorations (remedial) and enrichment. Remedial is an action carried out by educators to support students who obtain substandard learning achievements.³ In accordance with Buna'i, remedial ramifications in education encompass diverse purposes. Firstly, the corrective purpose, which aims to rectify or enhance something that is deemed as not yet attained. Secondly, the comprehension purpose empowers both teachers and students to comprehend the learning obstacles they encounter. Thirdly, the adjustment purpose intends to implement modifications in the learning process in order to resolve the difficulties students face. Fourthly, the acceleration purpose possesses the ability to expedite the student's learning process, which was initially sluggish, through specialized learning designs in the remedial program.

¹ Leonie I Johann et al., "Upper Secondary Students' Thinking Pathways in Cell Membrane Biology – an Evidence-Based Development and Evaluation of Learning Activities Using the Model of Educational Reconstruction," *Journal of Biological Education* (January 2022): 1–22.

² Matthew M Cirigliano, Charles D Guthrie, and Martin V Pusic, "Click-Level Learning Analytics in an Online Medical Education Learning Platform," *Teaching and Learning in Medicine* 32, no. 4 (August 2020): 410–421.

³ Clever Ndebele, "Teacher Perceptions on the Effectiveness of an English Remedial Teaching Programme in Primary Schools in Zimbabwe: Towards an Alternative to the Deficit Model," *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 6, no. 3 (May 2014): 497–508.

Consequently, these various purposes enable the application of remedial practices to ameliorate and augment student learning achievements.⁴

Other efforts made besides remedial are enrichment activities.⁵ Through enrichment activities, teachers provide feedback to students who have above average abilities by providing more learning and directing them to things with more potential. The activities performed include, for example, supplementary tutoring or specialized training for students who are considered to require it.⁶ These two activities become an inseparable unit in the learning process. Teachers must be fair in providing treatment to students who have below average and above average learning outcomes. However, of the two activities in the follow-up evaluation above, the one that is mostly carried out in schools or madrasas in general is remedial activities.

According to the general theory, the implementation of suitable procedures during the execution of corrective exercise can lead to improvements in student learning outcomes. A notable instance of this phenomenon was observed in previous research, where the positive impact of this improvement endeavor became evident when teachers engaged in Classroom Action Research (PTK).⁷ In this approach, educators identify the level of students' learning completeness through multiple cycles, ranging from initial failure to the attainment of the maximum expected completeness. Nevertheless, it is worth noting that the displayed learning outcomes are already presented in the form of precise numerical values, meticulously documented in the research report. It is impossible to ascertain with certainty whether the teachers' remedial efforts or enhancements were executed in accordance with the prescribed procedures.

As happened in one of the madrasahs, namely MA Sabilah Muhtadin, where one of the teachers applied a remedial form of dhikr and memorization of short surahs. If students carry out the task, then the value will be increased from those who did not reach KKM to KKM. But on the contrary, if the student does not carry out the task, the value of the student concerned will remain as obtained during the evaluation. Remedial activities like this actually do not contain anything that is not good, especially if it is carried out by students who take shelter in madrasahs. Recitation and memorizing surahs is an implementation of learning that strongly supports the spiritual qualities of students. But what if such activities are used as remedial activities for learning that are basically not directly related to the material?

⁴ Ni Wayan Sri Darmayanti and I Komang Wisnu Budi Wijaya, *Evaluation of Science Learning* (Bali: Nilacakra, 2020), 157.

⁵ Tao-Ming Cheng et al., "Remedial Education for High-Risk University Freshmen – the Case of a University of Technology in Taiwan," *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 38, no. 2 (April 3, 2018): 241–256, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2018.1460255>.

⁶ Siti Misbah, "Application of the Feedback Partner Method to Improve Student Learning Achievement in Indonesian Language Subjects. Structure and Linguistic Material of Anecdotal Texts for Class Indonesian Learning (JPPI) 2, no. 2 (2022): 63–74.

⁷ Paula A Greathouse, "Effects of a Positive Youth Development Approach to Literacy through Young Adult Literature in the Secondary Remedial Reading Class: An Action Research Study," *Educational Action Research* 26, no. 2 (March 15, 2018): 220–238, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2017.1307127>.

Remedial implementation has the potential to enhance students' capabilities and academic achievements by addressing any unmet learning objectives. However, the observed discrepancy at MA Sabilal Muhtadin indicates a phenomenon that contradicts the appropriate procedure. The remedial measures employed fail to accurately identify students who have not fully grasped the subject matter, as the method of enhancing learning deviates from the prescribed material.

Based on the aforementioned findings, the forthcoming article intends to critically assess the execution of the remedial practices involving recollection and retention of surahs carried out at MA Sabilal Muhtadin. To serve as a point of reference and comparison, the author cites a previous article that explored the challenges encountered in remedial learning pertaining to Biology subjects. Aforementioned research brought to light that the hindrances encountered during the implementation of remedial learning were associated with the limited duration allocated for implementation and the non-compliance with the technical guidelines for remedial practices. Furthermore, the final category of remedial questions was deemed insufficient.⁸ Consequently, previous research has unveiled inadequacies in the implementation of remedial practices.

Meanwhile, this research will assess and weigh the appropriateness of the remedial carried out by teachers because they implement "unusual" remedial. This requires further study regarding the impact of remedial work on improving student learning outcomes. So the novelty of this research is to examine a unique remedial phenomenon and to assess whether these activities have an impact on the improvement or nonconformity of the remedial procedure itself. This study is important to conduct to analyze deviations in remedial teaching procedures which educators often do not realize. The outcomes of this investigation might offer suggestions for the madrasas involved to contemplate on the corrective measures that have been performed.

This article undertakes an analysis of three aspects. (1) provide a description of the implementation of remedial dhikr and the memorization of short surahs in general subjects at MA Sabilal Muhtadin, (2) investigate the underlying reasons for the implementation of these remedial practices in the context of dhikr and the memorization of short surahs in general subjects, (3) conduct an analysis of the deviations that occur in the remedial teaching procedures at MA Sabilal Muhtadin.

The qualitative methodology employed in this investigation is of a phenomenological nature. This specific approach was chosen due to its capacity to illuminate the phenomenon of remedial recitation and memorization of surahs, which, based on initial assumptions, diverged from established procedures. As a result, this phenomenon deviates from the general patterns of remedial habits. Additionally, the objective of this phenomenological study is to comprehensively explicate the observed phenomena in their original form, thereby conveying a naturalistic impression. By implementing this research methodology, we expect to gain a deep and extensive understanding of

⁸ Fauziyah Harahap, Nurliza, and Nanda EA Nasution, "Jurnal Pelita Pendidikan," *Jurnal Pelita Pendidikan* 8, no. 1 (2020): 52–61, <https://jurnal.unimed.ac.id/2012/index.php/pelita/article/view/17301/13178>.

the experiences of both the subjects and informants. Consequently, this will lead to the identification of effective solutions for the matters currently being investigated.

The participants in this study consisted of two individuals, to be exact a teacher of Sociology and a teacher of Geography. The selection of these individuals was based on the fact that only these two teachers conducted remedial activities focused on the recitation and memorization of surahs. Additionally, five informants were included in the study, comprising of one deputy head of the madrasah responsible for the curriculum and two students. These informants provided evidence of the implementation of remedial activities in recitation and memorization of surahs carried out by ER and YN. Furthermore, two other teachers served as informants in order to compare the implementation of remedial measures employed by each teacher. The selection of informants was based on their ability to provide relevant information that could effectively validate the research data pertaining to the implementation of remedial activities in recitation and memorization of surahs.

B. Implementation of Remedial Dhikr and Memorizing of Surahs

After assessing the learning progress, the teacher typically engages in remedial or corrective measures. The evaluation process may involve daily chapter-specific assessments or a comprehensive final evaluation conducted at the conclusion of the semester.⁹ Both activities are frequently undertaken as a means of introspection for educators, as well as a conclusive document that serves as a yardstick for enhancing pedagogical efficacy in the subsequent academic term.¹⁰ In addition, the implementation of remedial measures is typically directed towards timely completion prior to the subsequent phase of learning, with the purpose of effectively resolving the endeavor of enhancing both the educational experience and the academic performance of students.¹¹ In addition, remedial implementation takes place subsequent to the completion of the discussion chapter and the final semester examination in MA Sabilal Muhtadin, as observed by BB, one of the instructors at MA Sabilal Muhtadin, during an interview said that:

"Following the completion of the daily tests or discussion chapters, it is my customary practice to engage in remedial sessions. In the event that students' grades fall below the minimum passing threshold (KKM), I promptly administer remedial sessions to ensure that their grades are reconciled with those of their peers. Failure to address this issue would have an adverse impact on the final score recorded in the subsequent report, potentially resulting in a score that

⁹ Ajat Rukajat, *Teknik Evaluasi Pembelajaran* (Yogyakarta: Deepublish Publisher, 2018), 50.

¹⁰ Cassandra Préfontaine et al., "Assessment Tools for Reflection in Healthcare Learners: A Scoping Review," *Medical Teacher* 44, no. 4 (April 2022): 394–400.

¹¹ William R Cufach and Sandra Metts, "Remedial Processes in Embarrassing Predicaments," *Annals of the International Communication Association* 13, no. 1 (January 1990): 323–352.

*is below the KKM. It is important to note that students whose scores fall below the KKM face the possibility of being unable to attend class."*¹²

Referring to the results of the interviews, it can be seen that routine remedial activities are carried out, including when the discussion of the chapters has been completed and at the end of the semester or after tests. While different conditions were expressed by AR who said that:

*" I typically conduct remediation activities at the conclusion of the semester or after the exams have concluded. In my perspective, this approach offers a clearer assessment of the students' overall abilities, allowing me to evaluate the progress they've made throughout the entire semester. Consequently, I reserve remedial actions for the end of the semester."*¹³

Based on the interviews, it seems that there are contradictory opinions about when to implement remedial measures. BB subjects engage in routine remedial sessions upon completion of each chapter as well as at the conclusion of the semester, whereas AR subjects solely conduct them at the end of the semester. If observed, the implementation of remedial measures at MA Sabilal Muhtadin is solely a policy devised by individual teachers, lacking any specific regulations from the madrasah necessitating teachers to actively partake in the implementation of remedial measures, particularly in terms of the degree of intensity. Ultimately, disparities in perceptions regarding the intensity of these remedial activities can result in inequities in providing enhancements in learning.¹⁴ There exist specific subjects that pay minimal attention to the outcomes of student learning, while there are other subjects that exhibit great engagement in reflecting upon learning. In fact, students ought to receive more attention, particularly when their learning outcomes deteriorate, not solely at the end of the semester. Consistent implementation of remedial measures can assist in addressing issues associated with students' learning difficulties.¹⁵

The matter of remedial intensity is not only disregarded, but the implementation of remedial measures also deviates from the conventional remedial practices. Based on an interview with EN said that:

" During the odd semester of 2022, I scheduled the remedial sessions to take place at the semester's conclusion. Regarding the remedial process, I prescribed the memorization of short surahs, spanning from Ad-Dhuha to Surah An-Nas. The specific number of surahs to be memorized depended on the individual student's performance. Additionally, for some students,

¹²Interview with BB.

¹³Results of interviews with AR.

¹⁴ Hsien-Sheng Hsiao et al., "The Influence of Chinese Character Handwriting Diagnosis and Remedial Instruction System on Learners of Chinese as a Foreign Language," *Computer Assisted Language Learning* 28, no. 4 (July 2015): 306–324.

¹⁵ Maham Khalid and Gulnaz Anjum, "Use of Remedial Teaching Approaches for Dyslexic Students: Experiences of Remedial Teachers Working in Urban Pakistan," ed. Meihua Qian, *Cogent Psychology* 6, no. 1 (January 2019): 1580181.

I recommended reciting these surahs in the form of a prolonged wird (devotional recitation) after prayers rather than strict memorization."¹⁶

The same thing was also conveyed by YN who said that:

*"My remedial is just memorizing short surahs from juz 30. But I invite them to deposit after every lesson I leave 15 minutes. If someone can memorize longer surahs like Yasin or Al-Waqi'ah, I will definitely give them extra points because I really appreciate their memorization."*¹⁷

The aforementioned subjects exemplify the dissimilarity between the implementation of remedial activities at MA Sabilal Muhtadin and remedial activities in general. One of the remedial activities conducted entails the memorization of concise surahs and dhikr. Some individuals carry out this activity solely at the conclusion of each semester, while others execute it at the termination of each learning session. If these corrective activities are performed in relation to the Al-Qur'an, then it is highly suitable to do so. Still, if they are employed in all parts of learning material, it will generate discordance with the learning objectives themselves. As previous studies have indicated, remedial activities are learning endeavors intended to enhance student learning outcomes. Thus, the implementation and measures taken must adhere to the learning objectives.¹⁸

Additionally, it is extremely unlikely to generalize the implementation of corrective measures for students who exhibit lower learning outcomes.¹⁹ Furthermore, the mere act of memorizing short surahs and reciting dhikr does not address the issue of low learning outcomes, which cannot solely be attributed to a lack of spiritual intake. Instead, low learning outcomes must be accurately identified by examining the suboptimal aspects that hinder achievement.²⁰ Consequently, teachers cannot unilaterally determine the necessary improvements for students; they must also effectively identify and coordinate with students to address the difficulties they encounter, which contribute to low learning outcomes.²¹

Teachers should also offer remedial treatment in implementation, without increasing the workload on students. The primary objective of remedial education is to reinforce learning by identifying specific areas for improvement, rather than burdening students with excessive and

¹⁶Interview results with EN.

¹⁷Interview results with YN.

¹⁸ Qun Zhao, Jin-Long Wang, and Shih-Hao Liu, "A New Type of Remedial Course for Improving University Students' Learning Satisfaction and Achievement," *Innovations in Education and Teaching International* 59, no. 6 (November 2, 2022): 711–23, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2021.1948886>.

¹⁹ Devy Wahyu Cindy Mulyani and Abidinsyah, "Strategi Pembelajaran Peserta Didik Anak Berkebutuhan Khusus (ABK) di SDN Antar Baru 1 Maraban," *Journal Pendidikan Hayati* 7, no. 4 (2021): 197–216, <https://mathdidactic.stkipbjm.ac.id/index.php/JPH/article/view/1597>.

²⁰ Christine Robinson, "To Be 'Formed' and 'Informed': Early Years' Educators' Perspectives of Spirituality and Its Affordance in Faith-Based Early Learning Centres," *International Journal of Children's Spirituality* 25, no. 3–4 (October 1, 2020): 254–71, <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364436X.2020.1848810>.

²¹ Barry Mak, Chloe Lau, and Alan Wong, "Effects of Experiential Learning on Students: An Ecotourism Service-Learning Course," *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism* 17, no. 2 (April 2017): 85–100.

irrelevant assignments.²² However, there may be exceptions when remedial learning is focused on subjects like memorizing the Qur'an Hadith, where it becomes understandable for teachers to employ such methods. Nonetheless, teachers should enhance their guidance in aiding memorization rather than merely providing instructions for memorization.

The effect of engaging in remedial dhikr and committing this surah to memory has a significant influence on the grievances experienced by students. As stated by one of the AM students who took part in the remedial:

*"I actually object to memorizing. I prefer to be told to just rework my wrong answers."*²³

The same thing was also conveyed by ND saying that:

*"I prefer just doing the questions rather than memorizing. In my opinion, it felt strange when I studied Geography but the remedial was memorizing short surahs. There are also those who study Islamic history, but in remedial they also memorize surahs. There are even Sociology students who are told to recite the wird or dhikr after prayer."*²⁴

Based on the perspectives provided by the aforementioned two students, it becomes apparent that the remedial endeavors of engaging in dhikr and memorizing surahs are considerably demanding. This serves to indicate that the implemented measures to ameliorate substandard academic achievements do not genuinely address the predicament. The outcome may, in fact, yield the opposite effect, whereby students feel increasingly encumbered, thereby exacerbating their confusion. In the context of remedial education, students ought to possess the capability to acknowledge the errors committed previously, whether stemming from a misunderstanding of the subject matter or an employment of unsuitable learning methodologies.²⁵ If, however, the substance of the material being presented varies, then the responsibility placed upon students will indeed escalate.

If the remedial learning conducted deviates from the primary learning objectives, it will lead to the misrepresentation of the repair evaluation outcomes.²⁶ Moreover, corrective learning not only reinforces the quality of education but also contributes to the advancement of students' learning outcomes as evaluated by the final corrective examination.²⁷ However, if teachers merely focus on memorizing recitations or surahs and base their final grades solely on this, the obtained grades will fail to accurately reflect the actual remedial process. Consequently, this perpetuates the phenomenon

²² Francesca Sgobbi, "The Effectiveness of Remedial Courses: New Evidence from Undergraduate Students in Industrial Engineering," *Education Economics* 30, no. 3 (May 2022): 320–337.

²³ Results of interviews with AM students.

²⁴ Results of interviews with ND students.

²⁵ K Andrew Parker, "A Modularized Tablet-Based Approach to Preparation for Remedial Mathematics," *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology* 47, no. 8 (November 2016): 1244–1260.

²⁶ Tracey Bretag et al., "Contract Cheating and Assessment Design: Exploring the Relationship," *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education* 44, no. 5 (July 2019): 676–691.

²⁷ Jennifer Cleland et al., "A Remedial Intervention Linked to a Formative Assessment Is Effective in Terms of Improving Student Performance in Subsequent Degree Examinations," *Medical Teacher* 32, no. 4 (January 2010): e185–e190.

known as "value manipulation" within the educational realm, whereby numerical scores become susceptible to manipulation without regard for the actual quality of learning and education.

Based on these established facts, it is evident that the remedial teaching program being executed at MA Sabilal Muhtadin does not align with the prescribed procedures that ought to be undertaken. Utilizing the practice of reciting dhikr and memorizing concise surahs as a means of assessing remedial progress is unsuitable for subjects of a general nature, such as Sociology and Geography. Consequently, it is imperative for the madrasah to allocate additional attention towards providing guidance to educators who are responsible for implementing the remedial program.

C. Background of The Implementation of Remedial Dhikr and Memorizing of Surahs

As a unique phenomenon of remedial implementation that is different from the usual practice, memorizing dhikr and short surahs does not just happen. There are several background factors so that such remedial is applied. A few of these factors encompass the following.

1. Limitations of Remedial Time Allocation

The primary cause for engaging in the practice of memorizing dhikr and short surahs as a remedial measure is the belief held by unscrupulous educators that it is necessitated by the restricted time frame allocated in the madrasah. According to EN explained that:

*"One of the reasons why I apply remedial dhikr and memorizing this surah is because usually the time allotted by madrasahs to pause after tests is very small. Usually given five days, not to mention that I, as homeroom teacher, also have to do other assignments. So with such a short time, I took the alternative of making a rote deposit. However, it was long ago that I told the children to memorize it first in preparation for remedial."*²⁸

Based on the explanation provided by EN, the practice of remedial dhikr and memorization of short surahs was conducted due to the limited time available for remedial activities. However, it should be noted that remedial sessions are not exclusively held after semester exams, but can also be conducted alongside active learning, provided that the allocated time is appropriate.²⁹ A competent teacher must possess meticulous planning skills, particularly in the organization of learning sessions.³⁰ The teacher needs to analyze the optimal time allocation for both regular and remedial learning throughout the semester.³¹ Furthermore, EN mentioned that students were informed that the remedial activities they were undertaking involved dhikr and surah memorization. In this context, the EN subject aims to enhance students' competency in a specific

²⁸Interview results with EN.

²⁹ Haryanto, *Evaluasi Pembelajaran* (Yogyakarta: UNY Press, 2020).

³⁰ Daniel Muijs et al., "State of the Art – Teacher Effectiveness and Professional Learning," *School Effectiveness and School Improvement* 25, no. 2 (April 2014): 231–256.

³¹ Danielle J Ford et al., "The Science Semester: Cross-Disciplinary Inquiry for Prospective Elementary Teachers," *Journal of Science Teacher Education* 24, no. 6 (October 2013): 1049–1072.

area. Nevertheless, it is crucial to address the areas of weakness during remedial sessions. Failure to do so may lead to a distortion of the essence and benefits of the remedial implementation.³²

Subject YN also explained the same thing as a general subject teacher that:

*"I also carry out remedial dhikr and memorize surahs due to time constraints. Sometimes, when I don't have time for class, I invite them to come to the office to deposit their memorization. I mean the remedial that just memorizes this is very little time, let alone having to remedial in the form of re-doing the questions. What's more, after the semester exams, we as teachers are very busy with other assignments and students also have a lot of remedial assignments in other subjects."*³³

Based on this explanation, it is evident that the rationale behind the adoption of rote remedial measures was prompted by time limitations. Although the instructor not only prioritizes the outcomes or values derived by students from a lesson, but also emphasizes the learning process itself.³⁴ The fundamental principle underlying remedial education lies in teaching students to introspect on their errors, which can be achieved through revisiting challenging questions or materials, rather than assigning unrelated tasks solely for the purpose of grading.³⁵ The matter of time allocation must be effectively coordinated between the instructor and the head or deputy head of the madrasah curriculum field to ensure the proper implementation of remedial procedures.

2. Remedial Problems Related to Students

Apart from the limited time allocated to carry out remedial work, the emergence of remedial dhikr and memorizing surahs also stems from student problems. According to EN says that:

*"I additionally engage in the practice of remedial dhikr and commit to memory concise surahs due to occasional student dissatisfaction when prompted to complete exercises. A subset of learners have even requested the continuation of remedial dhikr and recitation of this particular surah."*³⁶

Based on the outcomes of the interviews, it is evident that the rationale behind the introduction of remedial dhikr and memorizing surahs also originated from students who were deemed incapable if they were required to redo the questions. Despite the fact that the core

³² Asmidir Ilyas, Sisca Folastrri, and Solihatun, *Diagnosis Kesulitan Belajar dan Pembelajaran Remedial* (Semarang: Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2018), 43.

³³ Interview results with YN.

³⁴ Nur Ilahi, "Peranan Guru Profesional dalam Peningkatan Prestasi Siswa dan Mutu Pendidikan di Era Milenial" *Jurnal Asy-Syukriyyah* 21, no. 1 (2020): 1–20, <https://doi.org/10.36769/asy.v21i1.94>.

³⁵ Richard Allington et al., "What Is Remedial Reading? A Descriptive Study," *Reading Research and Instruction* 26, no. 1 (September 1986): 15–30.

³⁶ Interview results with EN.

essence of remedial lies in contemplation or re-education, rather than redoing questions.³⁷ The evaluation in the form of engaging with remedial questions is solely conducted to assess the effectiveness of the remedial process itself.³⁸ Additionally, the instructor also needs to explicate the purpose of the remedial implementation in a more comprehensive manner, rather than merely assigning tasks to students.³⁹

A different opinion was expressed by YN that:

*"There are students whose memorization of the Qur'an is good but when they are asked to do questions, especially in my subject, their scores are very low. So I really regret it if the student in question scores low in my subject. To make up for his low score, I better focus on what he can do."*⁴⁰

Subject YN's viewpoint demonstrates that the aptitude of students in a specific domain may encompass proficiency in other domains. However, this assumption is clearly unfounded as the process of learning necessitates the consideration of aspects that align with the subject's competence in order to achieve the intended objectives.⁴¹ Teachers must exercise caution when establishing standards for student evaluation and subsequently provide appropriate interventions to meet these standards.⁴² Additionally, addressing the challenges faced by students who attain low scores in certain areas should involve undertaking actions such as analyzing learning obstacles or exploring alternative methodologies that facilitate comprehension for students.⁴³

3. The Problem of Teachers Who Don't Understand Remedial Procedures

The most prevailing element in the cause for engaging in remedial dhikr and memorizing surahs, aside from the aforementioned two factors, stems from the teacher's deficiency in comprehending the appropriate procedures for implementing remedial practices. Based on the results of interviews with FA, who is the deputy head of the madrasah curriculum field, said that:

"In reaction to this remedial dhikr and surah recitation, I, in my capacity as the Deputy Head of Curriculum at the madrasah, refrained from making extensive comments. I have entrusted each teacher with the responsibility of handling student issues, including remedial

³⁷ Ron Best, "Pupil Perspectives on Remedial Education: An Empirical Comment," *International Journal of Adolescence and Youth* 1, no. 1 (January 1987): 69–97.

³⁸ Leni Fitrianti, "Prinsip Kontinuitas dalam Evaluasi Proses Pembelajaran," *Jurnal Pendidikan* 10, no. 1 (2018): 89–102, <http://www.journal.staihubbulwathan.id>.

³⁹ Muhammad Rifa'i, *Manajemen Peserta Didik (Pengelolaan Peserta Didik untuk Efektivitas Pembelajaran)* (Medan: CV Widya Puspita, 2018), 50.

⁴⁰ Interview results with YN.

⁴¹ Reijo Byman and Pertti Kansanen, "Pedagogical Thinking in a Student's Mind: A Conceptual Clarification on the Basis of Self-determination and Volition Theories," *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 52, no. 6 (December 1, 2008): 603–21, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313830802497224>.

⁴² Jordan D Bailey and Anthony DeFulio, "Predicting Substance Use Treatment Failure with Transfer Learning," *Substance Use & Misuse* 57, no. 13 (November 2022): 1982–1987.

⁴³ Jingying Wang, Ming-Lee Wen, and Min Jou, "Identifying Students' Difficulties When Learning Technical Skills via a Wireless Sensor Network," *Interactive Learning Environments* 24, no. 3 (April 2, 2016): 396–408, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2013.851091>.

measures. Another shortcoming to address is the absence of specialized training for our teachers in the effective execution of remedial strategies.”⁴⁴

According to the aforementioned statement by FA, it is evident that the practice of remedial dhikr and the memorization of surahs can be conducted as a result of the teacher's lack of comprehension regarding the nature of the remedial itself. Furthermore, the madrasah did not allocate much attention to this particular circumstance. In actuality, in the guidelines for the implementation of the curriculum, it is imperative to complete the execution of various facets, which includes the implementation of remedial measures.⁴⁵ The head of the madrasah and their staff must establish a bureaucratic framework that is in sync with the teacher team in order to assess their individual performances.⁴⁶ This approach serves to rectify and amend any errors that may have been made, including those that are associated with remedial actions.

The active involvement of supervisors and the district ministry of religion is highly essential, not only in the madrasah. They possess the legitimate authority to oversee the teachers' performance in madrasahs, despite granting autonomous rights to the madrasahs for individual growth. However, as a measure of control, it is necessary for relevant parties to conduct regular inspections and evaluations.⁴⁷ Every institution, particularly educational establishments like madrasah, necessitates supervision, guidance, and training to attain optimal performance and objectives.⁴⁸

D. Analysis of the Suitability of Remedial Procedures

The occurrence of the remedia case at MA Sabital Muhtadin undoubtedly demonstrates the caliber of education in the nation, particularly in the realm of assessment. Indeed, the crux of assessment lies in the form of an appraisal, which serves as a means to acquire pertinent information for the enhancement and advancement of education in the future.⁴⁹ Based on this assertion, assessment unquestionably assumes a paramount importance. It is through assessment that an individual's capabilities become discernible, weaknesses can be examined, and subsequent measures can be implemented. In the event that this evaluation process falters, the prospects for improvement become nonexistent.

⁴⁴Results of interviews with FA.

⁴⁵ Wardatut Tholiah and Moh. Sahlan, "Efektivitas Program Remedial dan Pengayaan dalam Penilaian Pendidikan Agama Islam," *Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Agama* 8, no. 1 (2022): 33–54.

⁴⁶ Wardah Hanafie Das and Abdul Halik, *Kompetensi Manajerial Kepala Madrasah dan Relevansinya dengan Profesionalisme Guru* (Jawa Timur: Penerbit Uwais, 2019), 25.

⁴⁷ Doris Holzberger and Anja Schiepe-Tiska, "Is the School Context Associated with Instructional Quality? The Effects of Social Composition, Leadership, Teacher Collaboration, and School Climate," *School Effectiveness and School Improvement* 32, no. 3 (July 2021): 465–485.

⁴⁸ Achmad Anwar Batubara, Hendri Fauza, "Peran Kepala Madrasah sebagai Supervisor dalam Meningkatkan Profesionalitas Guru MAN 1 Medan," *Hijri* 9, no. 2 (2020): 11, <https://doi.org/10.30821/hijri.v9i2.8364>.

⁴⁹Ano Suharna, 'Evaluation of Education from an Islamic Perspective', *Qathruna Journal*, 3.2 (2016), 52.

Linguistically, the term remedial originates from the English language and conveys the notion of healing, treating, rectifying, or enhancing. Remedial learning, in essence, constitutes an educational endeavor geared towards improvement, executed in a methodical and systematic manner, with the intention of expediting students' attainment of educational objectives.⁵⁰ Furthermore, remedial learning might be seen as the teacher's effort, with or without the assistance of external parties, to establish an atmosphere that allows certain individuals or groups of students to optimize their developmental potential, thereby empowering them to meet the minimum expected standards for educational achievement.⁵¹ The rationale behind this lies in Skinner's assertion that a student should be permitted to proceed to the subsequent educational material only if they have truly mastered the content of the preceding lesson. Students who have not met the predetermined criteria, both in terms of overall performance and specific objectives, necessitate consistent and continuous remediation efforts.⁵²

The lack of command over academic content by a student can be attributed to a multitude of factors. These factors involve not enough allocation of time for studying, inadequacy of educational resources provided by the educational institution, inadequacy of infrastructure and facilities, as well as deficiencies in the physical or intellectual capacities of the student in question. Consequently, students who demonstrate evidence of this through their examination results necessitate the implementation of remedial measures in order to enhance their command over reading, arithmetic, and the capacity to pursue advanced education or to comprehend the course material.⁵³

There are several activities that must be carried out in carrying out remedial learning, namely 1) repeating the previous subject, 2) repeating part of the subject to be mastered, 3) solving problems or completing questions together and 4) giving special assignments.⁵⁴ The implementation of such activities elucidates the significant role that educators or other stakeholders play in aiding students who encounter challenges in their academic progress. Indeed, the process commences with the repetition of the preceding topic, rather than instantly posing inquiries or memorizing extraneous information unrelated to the subject matter being instructed.

Based on the aforementioned essence and remedial activities, it becomes evident that remedial activities are highly systematic in nature. This can be attributed to the fact that the objective of these activities is to facilitate comprehension among students who initially faced difficulties in understanding due to certain factors. Undoubtedly, the activities encompassed within the

⁵⁰Maria Waldetrudis Lidi, "Remedial Learning as an Effort to Overcome Learning Difficulties", *Foundation*, Vol. 9, no. 1 (2018): p. 4.

⁵¹Abin Syamsuddin Makmun, *Educational Psychology: Module Teaching System Toolkit*, (Bandung: Teen Rosdakarta, 2012).

⁵²Mukhtar and Rusmini, *Remedial Teaching: Theory and Application in Learning*, (Jakarta: Nimas Multima, 2005).

⁵³Nathalie Louge, Emily Miksic, Yuntian Lu, "Remedial Education: Models and Approaches for Successful Impact on Student Achievement Technical Brief", *Global Education*, 2022, p. 4.

⁵⁴Eva Yustuti, "Remedial as an Effort to Overcome Learning Difficulties in Learning", *SKULA: Journal of Madrasah Teacher Professional Education*, Vol. 2, no. 1 (2022); h. 354.

aforementioned remedial approach are significantly dissimilar to the remedial activities implemented at MA Sabilal Muhtadin. There exists only one element that aligns with the notion of assigning tasks. However, these assignments deviate considerably from the instructional material provided. Hence, it can be affirmed that in cases where students struggle to grasp the teaching material, remediation is conducted through the process of memorizing dhikrs and surahs. Nevertheless, it is crucial to mention that this method does not contribute to a heightened comprehension of the material that has been instructed.

If one were to counter this assertion by claiming that the act of memorizing zikr and surah is beneficial, particularly for students attending madrasas, it cannot be disputed that engaging in dhikr and reciting surahs is indeed advantageous. Nonetheless, the issue at hand does not revolve around the inherent goodness or lack thereof in dhikr and surahs, but rather centers on the achievement of desired educational outcomes.

The government of Minnesota, as discovered through research conducted by the Office of the Legislative Auditor State of Minnesota, has allocated a total of 132 million dollars, in addition to another 80 million dollars obtained from the Improving America's Schools Act program. These funds are dedicated specifically for the purpose of providing specialized instruction to students who are encountering challenges with their learning. The goal is to utilize these funds to execute a sequence of planned and ongoing educational activities, with the intention of improving the academic performance of students. The observations of the examination, however, were rather unforeseen. It transpired that the implementation of structured remedial activities did not yield a significant and extensive impact on student achievement in the aforementioned region of Minnesota.⁵⁵

If we consider the initiatives and initiatives that have been implemented by the Minnesota government in relation to these corrective actions, it becomes apparent that the endeavor to enhance the educational process of students is not without challenges. Despite the substantial allocation of resources, the attainment rate remains relatively modest, particularly when employing remedial measures that deviate from the prescribed curriculum.

E. Conclusion

The implementation of remembrance and memorization of surahs at MA Sabilal Muhtadin lacks proper adherence to remedial procedures. The teachers who employ such remedial methods fail to consider the alignment between the objectives of the material taught and the remedial approach used. Recitation and memorization of surahs do not constitute a remedial teaching method that can effectively enhance the quality of students' learning. The factors contributing to the implementation of remedial recitation and memorization of surahs include limited time allocated for remedial activities, complex student issues, and teachers' incorrect comprehension of the remedial process itself. Based

⁵⁵Office of the Legislative Auditor State of Minnesota, "Remedial Education," A Program Evaluation Report, (Minnesota: Centennial Office Building, 1998), p. 1-75.

on the analysis conducted in this study, the implementation of remedial remembrance and memorization of the surah is deemed an inappropriate remedial procedure. It is imperative for teachers to prioritize the primary objective of remediation, which is to elevate the standard of learning rather than solely boosting learning outcomes or grades. The madrasah must be vigilant in monitoring the teachers' implementation of remedial measures. If any inappropriate policies are identified, the madrasah should offer guidance, such as organizing training sessions on remedial teaching topics. This initiative aims to provide teachers with a deeper understanding of effective and appropriate remedial implementation procedures. This investigation has uncovered a new phenomenon in the implementation of corrective actions, even though it merely signifies a finding and does not present a comprehensive resolution for addressing these matters.

F. References

- Allington, Richard, Helen Stuetzel, Mary Shake, and Sharron Lamarche. "What Is Remedial Reading? A Descriptive Study." *Reading Research and Instruction* 26, no. 1 (September 1986): 15–30.
- Bailey, Jordan D, and Anthony DeFulio. "Predicting Substance Use Treatment Failure with Transfer Learning." *Substance Use & Misuse* 57, no. 13 (November 2022): 1982–1987.
- Best, Ron. "Pupil Perspectives on Remedial Education: An Empirical Comment." *International Journal of Adolescence and Youth* 1, no. 1 (January 1987): 69–97.
- Bretag, Tracey, Rowena Harper, Michael Burton, Cath Ellis, Philip Newton, Karen van Haeringen, Sonia Saddiqui, and Pearl Rozenberg. "Contract Cheating and Assessment Design: Exploring the Relationship." *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education* 44, no. 5 (July 2019): 676–691.
- Byman, Reijo, and Pertti Kansanen. "Pedagogical Thinking in a Student's Mind: A Conceptual Clarification on the Basis of Self-determination and Volition Theories." *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research* 52, no. 6 (December 2008): 603–621.
- Cheng, Tao-Ming, Hsing-Yu Hou, Dinesh Chandra Agrawal, Ching-Fang Liaw, and Rung-Ching Chen. "Remedial Education for High-Risk University Freshmen – the Case of a University of Technology in Taiwan." *Asia Pacific Journal of Education* 38, no. 2 (April 2018): 241–256.
- Cirigliano, Matthew M, Charles D Guthrie, and Martin V Pusic. "Click-Level Learning Analytics in an Online Medical Education Learning Platform." *Teaching and Learning in Medicine* 32, no. 4 (August 2020): 410–421.
- Cleland, Jennifer, R K Mackenzie, S Ross, H K Sinclair, and A J Lee. "A Remedial Intervention Linked to a Formative Assessment Is Effective in Terms of Improving Student Performance in Subsequent Degree Examinations." *Medical Teacher* 32, no. 4 (January 2010): e185–e190.
- Cufach, William R, and Sandra Metts. "Remedial Processes in Embarrassing Predicaments." *Annals of the International Communication Association* 13, no. 1 (January 1990): 323–352.
- Das, Wardah Hanafie, and Abdul Halik. *Kompetensi Manajerial Kepala Madrasah Dan Relevansinya Dengan Profesionalisme Guru*. Jawa Timur: Penerbit Uwais, 2019.

- Fitrianti, Leni. "Prinsip Kontinuitas Dalam Evaluasi Proses Pembelajaran." *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan* 10, no. 1 (2018): 90–91.
- Ford, Danielle J, Steve Fifield, John Madsen, and Xiaoyu Qian. "The Science Semester: Cross-Disciplinary Inquiry for Prospective Elementary Teachers." *Journal of Science Teacher Education* 24, no. 6 (October 2013): 1049–1072.
- Greathouse, Paula A. "Effects of a Positive Youth Development Approach to Literacy through Young Adult Literature in the Secondary Remedial Reading Class: An Action Research Study." *Educational Action Research* 26, no. 2 (March 2018): 220–238.
- Harahap, Fauziyah, Nurliza, and Nanda E. A. Nasution. "Jurnal Pelita Pendidikan." *Jurnal Pelita Pendidikan* 8, no. 1 (2020): 52–61.
- Haryanto. *Evaluasi Pembelajaran*. Yogyakarta: UNY Press, 2020.
- Hendri Fauza, Achmad Anwar Batubara,. "Peran Kepala Madrasah Sebagai Supervisor Dalam Meningkatkan Profesionalitas Guru Man 1 Medan." *Hijri* 9, no. 2 (2020): 11.
- Holzberger, Doris, and Anja Schiepe-Tiska. "Is the School Context Associated with Instructional Quality? The Effects of Social Composition, Leadership, Teacher Collaboration, and School Climate." *School Effectiveness and School Improvement* 32, no. 3 (July 2021): 465–485.
- Hsiao, Hsien-Sheng, Cheng-Sian Chang, Chiao-Jia Chen, Chia-Hou Wu, and Chien-Yu Lin. "The Influence of Chinese Character Handwriting Diagnosis and Remedial Instruction System on Learners of Chinese as a Foreign Language." *Computer Assisted Language Learning* 28, no. 4 (July 2015): 306–324.
- Illahi, Nur. "Peranan Guru Profesional Dalam Peningkatan Prestasi Siswa Dan Mutu Pendidikan Di Era Milenial." *Jurnal Asy-Syukriyyah* 21, no. 1 (2020): 1–20.
- Ilyas, Asmidir, Sisca Folastrri, and Solihatun. *Diagnosis Kesulitan Belajar Dan Pembelajaran Remedial*. Semarang: Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2018.
- Johann, Leonie I, Fredrik K H Rusk, Michael J Reiss, and Jorge Groß. "Upper Secondary Students' Thinking Pathways in Cell Membrane Biology – an Evidence-Based Development and Evaluation of Learning Activities Using the Model of Educational Reconstruction." *Journal of Biological Education* (January 2022): 1–22.
- Khalid, Maham, and Gulnaz Anjum. "Use of Remedial Teaching Approaches for Dyslexic Students: Experiences of Remedial Teachers Working in Urban Pakistan." Edited by Meihua Qian. *Cogent Psychology* 6, no. 1 (January 2019): 1580181.
- Louge, Nathalie, Emily Miksic, and Yuntian Lu. "Remedial Education: Models and Approaches for Successful Impact on Student Achievement Technical Brief." *Global Education*, 2022.
- Mak, Barry, Chloe Lau, and Alan Wong. "Effects of Experiential Learning on Students: An Ecotourism Service-Learning Course." *Journal of Teaching in Travel & Tourism* 17, no. 2 (April 2017): 85–100.
- Makmun, Abin Syamsuddin. *Psikologi Kependidikan: Perangkat Sistem Pengajaran Modul*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2012.
- Misbah, Siti. "Penerapan Metode Umpan Balik (Feed Back Partner) Untuk Meningkatkan Prestasi Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Materi Struktur Dan Kebahasaan Teks

- Anekdote Kelas X IPS-2 SMAN 4 Kota Bima Semester 1 Tahun Pelajaran 2020/2021." *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI)* 2, no. 2 (2022): 63–74.
- Muijs, Daniel, Leonidas Kyriakides, Greetje van der Werf, Bert Creemers, Helen Timperley, and Lorna Earl. "State of the Art – Teacher Effectiveness and Professional Learning." *School Effectiveness and School Improvement* 25, no. 2 (April 2014): 231–256.
- Mukhtar, and Rusmini. *Pengajaran Remedial: Teori Dan Penerapannya Dalam Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Nimas Multima, 2005.
- Mulyani, Devy Wahyu Cindy, and Abidinsyah. "Strategi Pembelajaran Peserta Didik Anak Berkebutuhan Khusus (ABK) Di SDN Antar Baru 1 Maraban." *Jurnal Pendidikan Hayati* 7, no. 4 (2021): 197–216.
- Ndebele, Clever. "Teacher Perceptions on the Effectiveness of an English Remedial Teaching Programme in Primary Schools in Zimbabwe: Towards an Alternative to the Deficit Model." *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 6, no. 3 (May 2014): 497–508.
- Office of the Legislative Auditor State of Minnesota. *Remedial Education: A Program Evaluation Report*. Minnesota, 1998.
- Parker, K Andrew. "A Modularized Tablet-Based Approach to Preparation for Remedial Mathematics." *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology* 47, no. 8 (November 2016): 1244–1260.
- Préfontaine, Cassandra, Isabelle Gaboury, Hélène Corriveau, Jacinthe Beauchamp, Chantal Lemire, and Marie-Josée April. "Assessment Tools for Reflection in Healthcare Learners: A Scoping Review." *Medical Teacher* 44, no. 4 (April 2022): 394–400.
- Rifa'i, Muhammad. *Manajemen Peserta Didik (Pengelolaan Peserta Didik Untuk Efektivitas Pembelajaran)*. Medan: CV Widya Puspita, 2018.
- Robinson, Christine. "To Be 'Formed' and 'Informed': Early Years' Educators' Perspectives of Spirituality and Its Affordance in Faith-Based Early Learning Centres." *International Journal of Children's Spirituality* 25, no. 3–4 (October 2020): 254–271.
- Rukajat, Ajat. *Teknik Evaluasi Pembelajaran*. Yogyakarta: Deepublish Publisher, 2018.
- Sgobbi, Francesca. "The Effectiveness of Remedial Courses: New Evidence from Undergraduate Students in Industrial Engineering." *Education Economics* 30, no. 3 (May 2022): 320–337.
- Suharna, Ano. "Evaluasi Pendidikan Perspektif Islam." *Jurnal Qathruna* 3, no. 2 (2016): 52.
- Tholiah, Wardatut, and Moh. Sahlan. "Efektivitas Program Remedial Dan Pengayaan Dalam Penilaian Pendidikan Agama Islam." *Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Agama* 8, no. 1 (2022): 33–54.
- Wang, Jingying, Ming-Lee Wen, and Min Jou. "Identifying Students' Difficulties When Learning Technical Skills via a Wireless Sensor Network." *Interactive Learning Environments* 24, no. 3 (April 2016): 396–408.
- Yustuti, Eva. "Remedial Sebagai Suatu Upaya Dalam Mengatasi Pembelajaran Kesulitan Belajar." *SKULA: Jurnal Pendidikan Profesi Guru Madrasah* 2, no. 1 (2022): 354.
- Zhao, Qun, Jin-Long Wang, and Shih-Hao Liu. "A New Type of Remedial Course for Improving University Students' Learning Satisfaction and Achievement." *Innovations in Education and Teaching International* 59, no. 6 (November 2022): 711–723.

